Alan H. Cadwallader

Colossae, Colossians, Philemon

The Interface

V&R

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

Novum Testamentum et Orbis Antiquus/ Studien zur Umwelt des Neuen Testaments

Volume 127

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

Alan H. Cadwallader

Colossae, Colossians, Philemon

The Interface

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek:
The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data available online: https://dnb.de.

Typesetting by SchwabScantechnik, Göttingen

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht Verlage | www.vandenhoeck-ruprecht-verlage.com

ISSN 2197-5124
ISBN 978-3-647-50002-7

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

To colleagues and friends in the
Colloquium on Material Culture and Ancient Religion

To its leaders, Steven J. Friesen, Daniel Schowalter,
Christine Thomas and James Walters

And in memory of Dennis E. Smith

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

Table of Contents

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

Acknowledgements

Colossae has been a research focus for me since 1998. The inquiry into its history and remains has uncovered clues from across the world, from The Hermitage in St Petersburg to the Special Libraries at the University of Aberdeen to the British Institute in Ankara, and so many more collections that occasionally will be glimpsed in these pages. Museoarcheology has been a critical component of the investigation, built on the slightest hint and clue coming from individuals or submerged in a footnote in an outlier text. The expanding digitalization of materials — coins, inscriptions, papyri and artifacts — has released an invaluable volume of evidence, some of which has proven intricately relevant to the study of the site but most providing a rich store-house of *comparanda* that has helped to elucidate the jewels of the site itself. Most valuable of all have been the feet on the ground and, occasionally, eyes in the heights. My primary purpose herein, an objective that has driven me for more than two decades, is to provide as complete a coverage as possible of the material evidence of Colossae as can be recovered to date. I am under no illusion that this accumulation will not be supplemented in coming years; indeed, my hope is that herein will be found as complete a gathering as currently possible that will enable progress in the research on Colossae to be untrammeled by the need to repeat the foundational aggregation that has pre-occupied me these years past. My secondary purpose has been to establish that textual materials, most fulsomely two books of the Christian Testament, can fruitfully be brought into dialogue with the material resources that have been mustered. In that sense, this is a hybrid work, neither occupying the sometimes hermetic bubble of Christian commentary nor acquiescing in the sometimes justifiable suspicion of Christian texts for historical enquiry.

Inevitably, and thankfully, this work has been fostered, encouraged, supported (sometimes with good Turkish coffee) and critiqued (sometimes with fine wine in disparate locales). Those who have been almost constant companions and those who have simply dropped in with serendipitous offerings are manifold. There is always the danger in surveying such a span of time, that the memory of names and faces will suffer a glitch, much like the random for-

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

tunes of inscriptions, one passing to lime manufacture, another preserved in a museum. So it is with some trepidation that I make an attempt to recall those whose contributions have been essential to the shaping of this work.

From germinating days at Flinders University in South Australia, Michael Trainor and Claire Smith held out the hopes and vision of research into Colossae. Their expertise conjoined the two poles of the spectrum mentioned previously; their congeniality demonstrated that a hybrid enterprise was possible, indeed desirable. The enthusiasm of post-graduate students in the Flinders Greek Reading Group ensured that I was constantly fired to draw in material and textual evidence for study and was made accountable for premature interpretations and challenged to consider alternatives. The membership of course changed over the years; a number have articulated into their own fields of excellence. Nonetheless, the names of Rosemary Canavan, Julie Hooke (†), Joan Riley, Emily Harding, Christine Lawrance (†), Jutta Jokiranta, Cameron Doody, Shelly Li are inscribed as honorands of the early years.

Librarians can be gate-keepers to a world of discovery; they can also energize that role with their welcome, their suggestions and their introductions to other scholars. The list is long and some have since moved on to other ventures: Beth Prior at Flinders not only ensured that ways were found for materials but even took time out of her own sabbatical to dig out manuscripts at the British Library; Kimberley Stansfield at the London Library; Sue Hemmens at the Archbishop Marsh Library; Ciara Stewart at the National Library of Ireland; Paul Jackson at the Joint Library of the Hellenic and Roman Societies at the University of London; Patsy Williams and Louisa Yates at Gladstone Library; Michelle Gait at the Special Libraries at Aberdeen; Dimitrios Chronis at the Halki Theological Library at Heybeliada; Fr Nicodemos at the Leimonos Monastery on Lesbos; and the numerous staff at the British Library and at Dumbarton Oaks Library — all these went out of their way to hunt down rare books and manuscripts to assist my research.

Archive and museum directors have been similarly generous in their accommodation of my often very particular requests, at times supplementing the provision of access with a well-timed tea, coffee or meal. Special thanks to Ian Jenkins (†) of the Greek and Roman Antiquities Department at the British Museum, and at the same institution, Andrew Meadows in Numismatics and Sheila O'Connell in Prints; to Hilary Chambers of the Warrington Record Office; to Georgios Matzelos, Nikos Giannaros and Anna Lyssikatou who opened for me the treasures of the Patriarchal Institute of Patristic Studies in Thessalonike; to Peter Catt for permission to view the substantial coin collection at St John's Anglican Cathedral in Brisbane; to Svetlana Adaxina, Zhanna Etsina and Olga Gorskaya for uncovering an exquisite intaglio-ring held in The Hermitage Museum at St Petersburg; to Hugh Elton, Lutgarde Vandeput, Gülgün Erdivan and Yaprak Eran at the British Institute in Ankara; to Jonathan Shea curator of lead seals at Dumbarton Oaks; to Maurice Tucker, Master of University College Durham; to Karsten Darmen at the Münzkabinett of the

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

Staatliche Museum in Berlin; to James G. Crow at the Gertrude Bell Archives at the University of Newcastle-on-Tyne; and to Eugene Rae at the Royal Geographic Society in London.

No attempt to promote scholarly research can succeed without the learned contributions of colleagues. It will be clear from the Dedication how important the leadership and membership of the *Colloquium on Material Culture and Ancient Religion* has been in my formation. They too belong among the following. Sometimes a snatch of conversation, sometimes an extended discussion, sometimes a harsh reminder of either methodology or missing reference, sometimes the digging out of a buried source, have made an inestimable impact on my thinking and writing. Of course, being academics, they are still likely to dispute some of the results presented here, whether lingering mistakes or determined lines of interpretation. That is as it should be. Nonetheless, for their timely, even if, at times, intemperate remarks, I remain deeply grateful. So manifold thanks (in no particular order) to Marie Turner, Michael Theophilos, Elizabeth Minchin, John Chryssavgis, Müjgan Koç, Greg Horsley, Flora Karagianni, David Sim, Endor Varinlioğlu, Thomas Corsten, Felicity Harley, David Laiteo, Ali Ceylan, Paul Foster, Charlotte Roueché, Erim Konakçi, James McLaren, Cédric Brélaz, Ekatarini Tsalampouni, Bilal Sögüt, Daryn Lehoux, Cristian Tomas, Stephan Heilen, Angela Standhartinger, Larry Welborn, Christina Kokkinia, Valeriy Alikin, Katharina Martin, Bahadır Duman, Ros Kearsley, Patrick Armstrong, Pauline Allen, Chris de Wet, Ismail Albayrak, Wolfgang Hübner, Lukas Bormann, Celal Şimşek, Bronwen Neil, Haşim Yıldız, Wendy Mayer, Ulrich Huttner, Tina Shepardson, Andrew Burnett, Geoff Dunn, Hatice Erdemir, Peter Arzt-Grabner, Kosta Simic, Mike White, Peter Lewis, Halvor Moxnes and by no means least, Jim Harrison.

But the collegiate of learning and research is not the complete picture. Numerous people have been incredibly generous in time, interest and in contributing their knowledge and abilities for my research. More than that, they have offered hospitality, even, in some cases, without any introduction to me. I have learned that, at least at ground level, the fundamental convention of Turkish life is hospitality. Particular thanks must be extended to Deniz Canpolat and his wider family, especially his uncle, the novelist Kemal Yaçsin, to a succession of Governors of Denizli, Yusuf Ziya Goksü, Gazi Şimşek and Abdülkadir Demir, and mayors of Honaz, Melüt Tüfekçi and Turgut Devecioğlu and their staff, to the Denizli Rotary and Rotoract Clubs who invited updates on research, to local media professionals, Hakan Kurt and Irfan Çam, and most especially to the Iyilikçi and Bayrak families whose kindness and assistance were boundless.

A particular debt needs to be acknowledged for the support and professionalism of the Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht publishers who committed to bringing this book into the light of day, most especially Jörg Persch, Izaak de Hulster and the editors of the series, with a special thanks to the ever-patient and helpful Miriam Lux and Renate Rehkopf.

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

Finally, a special thanks is due to my son Daniel, whose architectural design expertise was in constant demand for the presentation of photographs and diagrams herein, and to my partner, the novelist Robyn Cadwallader, who has managed to combine a keen interest in my work with a healthy sense of humor through the long months of pandemic lockdown.

August 2021

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

Abbreviations

The abbreviations followed are those recommended by:
- the *Association Internationale d'Épigraphie Grecque et Latine* (for epigraphical sources)
- the *Checklist of Greek, Latin, Demotic and Coptic Papyri, Ostraca and Tablets* (for papyri)
- the *Society of Biblical Literature Handbook of Style*[2] (for classical and biblical texts)
- *L'année philologique* (for journals).

Where additional abbreviations are given, they are clarified in the text.

All photographs are by the author unless otherwise specified.

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

Introduction: Colossae and a material life

The revival of interest in artifacts and spatial arrangements of the ancient Greek, Roman and Phrygian worlds has led to the "material turn" in recent classical and New Testament scholarship.[1] This has had enormous benefits in re-situating New Testament writings as participants in the ancient world rather than as reinforcements of ecclesial positions. The approaches are generally less interested in archaeology as biblical proofs. Rather material culture reconnects biblical texts with the visual, spatial and societal locale from which they emerged, to which they contributed and within which they competed. Helmut Koester was adamant that "To understand the history of religions, it is necessary to study all materials relating to the life of a society, including nonliterary data — not as the 'background' of early Christianity but as the world of the early Christians."[2] The appreciation of the past, interpreted through various disciplines and theoretical constructs, enables contemporary Pauline readers to gain a more nuanced understanding of the meaning of texts and of the demand for hermeneutical sophistication in appropriating the past.

1 See, for example, L. Mitchell and L. Rubinstein (eds.), *Greek History and Epigraphy: Essays in honour of P. J. Rhodes* (Swansea: Classical Press of Wales, 2009); N. P. DesRosiers and L. C. Vuong (eds.), *Religious Competition in the Greco-Roman World* (Atlanta, GA: SBL, 2016); M. Arnhold, H. O. Maier, and J. Rüpke (eds.), *Seeing the God: Image, Space, Performance and Vision in the Religion of the Roman Empire* (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2018); D. C. Burnett, *Studying the New Testament through Inscriptions: An Introduction* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Academic, 2019); M. Kotrosits, *The Lives of Objects: Material Culture, Experience and the Real in the History of Early Christianity* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2020). Note also the Harvard Theological Studies monographs edited by S. J. Friesen, D. N. Schowalter *et al.* and *The First Urban Churches* series, edited by J. R. Harrison and L. L. Welborn.

2 H. Koester, "Epilogue: Current Issues in New Testament Scholarship," in *The Future of Early Christianity: Essays in Honor of Helmut Koester* edited by B. A. Pearson (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991), 473.

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

This remembering is nothing new. It was played out in the dynamics of urban and rural life in the ancient world.[3] For a center with Colossae's immense chronological span, the memory of past ages was etched into the topography of settlement, the negotiations of the flux and continuity of change in material expressions and even into the name that governed the identity of its inhabitants. That memory was fluid, as much constructed by the inherited material and narrative traces as construed by the demands and conceptual frameworks that each passing "present" brought to bear in the handling of the bequest. Occasional stations of memories occurred, but, if nothing else, the renowned ethnic mix in ancient Anatolia testifies to the fragility of the stationary. In this sense, the modern search for ancient Colossae is a participant in memory-making, albeit harnessed to different epistemological tools and interests, themselves also as subject to change as the remembrance(s) they construct.

But what is clear is that no longer are texts either privileged or sealed from their participation in materialist contexts, contexts replete with actors expressing a variety of responses. Even the texts themselves have been recognized as material artifacts that have their own material artifice contributing to a wider engagement than simply with the written documentation they house. In this sense, like an inscription, their construction occurs amongst a relative minority of human (and sometimes animal) contributors, but their impulse, performance, perception, appreciation and sheer survival encompasses a far wider audience, frequently consumerist if not illiterate (in the ancient world). It is worth recalling that, in spite of the mantra of the poverty of inscriptions from ancient Colossae to date, many of the epitaphs that have survived have done so *in situ*, that is, in the recognized city necropolis. These known epitaphs span almost three hundred years of the life of the necropolis (according to paleographical and internal dating methods). The analysis of anepigraphic, visible graves extends this period to half a millennium; the borrowed Phrygian typologies of graves or parts of graves touch a millennium of appropriated and transformed remembrance (see chapter 12). This most primal expression of memory — the management of the memory of the dead — demonstrates the ongoing contribution of material remains and textual testimony (in epigraphy and, less securely, archival record) to generations of Colossians and even now to contemporary historical researchers who, like me, are driven to relinquish the ephemeral world of the text and return the text to the world. Textuality, as Andrej Petrovic argues, is predicated on materiality,[4] but not merely on the material on which a text is cast but the sweep of materiality in which such a text gains a meaningful life.

3 See F. Rojas, *The Pasts of Roman Anatolia: Interpreters, Traces, Horizons* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019).

4 A. Petrovic, "The Materiality of Text: An Introduction," in *The Materiality of Text — Placement, Perception, and Presence of Inscribed Texts in Classical Antiquity* edited by A. Petrovic, I. Petrovic and E. Thomas (Leiden: Brill, 2019), 4.

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

The beginnings of modern material awareness of Colossae

In the sixteenth century, a relatively large number of European powers began to negotiate mercantile openings with the Ottoman sultans resplendent at "Le Porte", that is, old Constantinople, modern Istanbul. Trade was displacing military encounters as the preferred means of accumulating wealth and influence. At this stage, this was not a colonizing venture, though the attitudes that shaped that later development were already apparent. John Speed's popular map of "The Turkish Empire" provided a reader's hermeneutic in its margin, "The Turk is admired for nothing more than his sudden advancement to so great an Empire."[5] That Empire embraced huge tracts of land and peoples and provided access to spices, silk and other desirable goods, and created a demand for wool and mechanical "toys".

By the seventeenth century, France, Germany, Venice and England had a significant business presence in Constantinople/Istanbul, Smyrna and Aleppo further east. The Dutch, Swedish and other smaller European countries were also carving an active trading mission across the Ottoman Empire. Frequently, these mercantile companies were headed by a consul, who had much of the authority of a government diplomat, as well as responsibilities for the owners of "factories" (that is businesses) who ventured under license from the same country as the diplomat. But the larger companies also maintained chaplains whose primary charge was the spiritual care of the members and associates of the respective companies. These chaplains were also expected to promote learning and culture so that European identity would not be lost in the East, indeed would be demonstrated to be superior.

The opportunity to visit sites on the ground that had previously, for two hundred years or more, been substantially confined to a textual memorialization (for Europeans), brought a fundamental and radical change to interpretive method. The geographically blessed Smyrna, whose commerce and trade — the filthy lucre of material reality — had managed to shield the city's fortunes from Byzantine into Ottoman times, was a fitting capital from which to launch coastal and inland explorations. More importantly perhaps, cultured gatherings and the maintenance of loose records of findings established a reservoir of base knowledge. This in turn encouraged a gradual increase in understanding,[6] as well as a measure of competition to outdo one another's "finds".[7] Charles Perry could barely contain his sarcasm after Richard Pococke

5 J. Speed, *A Prospect of the Most Famous Parts of the World* (London: George Humble, 1626/7), sv.

6 F. Hasselquist, *Voyages and travels in the Levant: in the years 1749, 50, 51, 52. Containing observations in natural history etc, particularly on the Holy Land and the natural history of the Scriptures* (London: printed for L. Davis and C. Reymers, 1766), 22, 51.

7 This competition nudges into view with the occasional sharp barb of rebuke from one writer about another, often accusing of plagiarism or at least unacknowledged or distorted contributions. Jacob Spon's friendship with George Wheler evaporated when the former mis-appro-

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

passed off as his own labor sketches in his own book published in 1745.[8] He wrote, "This we presume is what our Betters have sometimes done before us; and that, perhaps, with less Candour and Ingenuousness, not acknowledging that they borrowed them, but given them to the World as the genuine Fruits of their own Pains and Dexterity."[9]

Evidently, there were gains, such as ecclesial and educational preferment, to be made from publishing as well as collecting artifacts and accounts of exploring Asia Minor.[10] The seven churches of Revelation, and, in Laodikeia's case, the bordering cities of Hierapolis and Colossae, were especially targeted for these cultural forays. But they were made possible by the extensive provision of economic and administrative supports by the Levant companies. Needless to say they provided important returns — confirmations of attitudes of Europeans about "Mahometan" Turks and "decadent" Greeks; a material support for the Renaissance knowledge project; and a fairly constant supply of artifacts, from coins to pottery, sculptures to inscriptions. One only has to peruse the eighteenth century auction catalogues of estate sales of deceased European aristocrats to gain some idea of how much additional material, besides the formal business goods, had been shipped from Ottoman ports. Laura Nasrallah's recent sketch of the "material turn" has focused on the nineteenth and early twentieth century.[11] This enabled North American involvement to be factored. But in reality the foundation goes back two centuries earlier and beyond.[12]

Two early chaplains of the English Levant Company stand out — the Reverend Doctor John Luke (1635?–1702) and the Reverend Thomas Smith (1638–1701) — the former helping the other to be awarded his position.[13] Luke

priated significant parts of the latter's work: G. Wheler, *A Journey to Greece* (London: Cademan, Kettlewell and Churchill, 1682), preface. Paul Rycaut seems to have considered that his position as consul authorized him to "borrow" and not return notes and journals made by the Rev'd John Luke and William Trumbull; see S. Anderson, *An English Consul in Turkey: Paul Rycaut at Smyrna 1667–1668* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989), 282. So concerned was Thomas Smith that his Latin books were going to be translated into English by another (Wheler? Without acknowledgement?) that this became a spur to doing the work himself: *Remarks upon the Manners, Religion and Government of the Turks together with a Survey of the Seven Churches of Asia, as They Now Lye in Their Ruines* (London: Moses Pitt, 1678), preface.

8 R. Pococke, *Description of the East and Some Other Countries* (London: W. Bowyer, 2 vols, 1745).

9 C. Perry, *A View of the Levant particularly of Syria, Egypt and Greece, In which their Antiquities, Government, Politics, Maxims, Manners and Customs (with many other Circumstances and Contingencies) are attempted to be Described and Treated on* (London: T. Woodward, C. Davis & J. Shuckburgh, 1743), xv. Perry was not the only one whose work was appropriated by Pococke; see R. Finnegan (ed.), *Letters from Abroad: the Grand Tour Correspondence of Richard Pococke and Jeremiah Milles* (Piltown: Pococke Press, vol 3, 2019), 8–12. He lifted entire sections from the volumes of Spon and Wheler as well!

10 N. Glaisyer, *The Culture of Commerce in England 1660–1720* (Suffolk: Boydell, 2006), 80.

11 L. S. Nasrallah, *Archaeology and the Letters of Paul* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019).

12 See T. M. P. Duggan, "On early antiquarians in Asia Minor to the start of the 19th century," *Gephyra* 17 (2019): 115–67.

13 Glaisyer, *Culture of Commerce*, 72.

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

was chaplain at Smyrna 1664–1669; Smith was chaplain at Constantinople 1668–1670. These two Church of England clergymen, as almost all who were appointed for the consolation of the Levant Company personnel, were required, in their application for the position, to deliver a sermon attended by up to a hundred people. This extravagant employment panel would then vote on whether the audition had gained the applicant the desired appointment.

John Luke's sermon provides a revelatory window into the change that was occurring in biblical scholarship. His was not the typical sermon, either in length (it was nearly twice as long as most) or content. The usual application sermon extolled business as a key means of demonstrating piety. Such an exponent was Edmund Chishull (chaplain 1702–1710). He draped his sermon about his assigned text, Psalm 107: "those that go down to the sea in ships to do business on the great waters". He argued from the general piety — that one should "prove the glory of God as the principal Aim of our Undertakings" — to the specific application that one should "show that the glory of God may more especially be promoted by Travel and Foreign Commerce". He unabashedly applied the epithet "the great Proprietor" to God.[14]

John Luke's performance, however, neither had as easy a text (he was assigned 1 Cor 15:29 that speaks of baptism of the dead)[15] nor delivered a saccharine blend of morality and commerce.[16] Rather, Luke repeatedly trumpets the "plain" reading of Scripture, one of the hallmarks of protestant exegetical method. It is clear that for Luke, history, along with the views and opinions of the ancient church — those closest to the text's writing — were critical components in the establishment of this "plain" reading. No longer was "plainness" to be established by traditional reiterations repeated over time or overweaning attention to grammatical and philological dissection. Striking in his survey of the various opinions about the Pauline verse was his assertion that the text ought not to be taken to establish the history, given the difficulty of interpretation. Rather history ought to be taken to deliver the meaning of the text.[17] This was a massive shift in method and governing assumptions. Moreover, that history was more likely, he argued, to be found by reference to those authors who wrote nearest the time. But again,

14 E. Chishull, *Sermon preached before the honourable company of merchants trading to the Levant-seas at St Hellen's, January 16 being Sunday 1697/8* (London: S. Manship, 1698), 1, 4.

15 For recent treatments, see J. R. White, "'Baptized on Account of the Dead': The Meaning of 1 Corinthians 15:29 in its Context," *JBL* 116 (1997): 487–99; N. H. Taylor, "Baptism for the dead (1 Cor 15:29)?" *Neotestamentica* 36 (2002): 111–20; M. F. Hull, *Baptism on account of the Dead (1 Cor 15:29): An Act of Faith in the Resurrection* (Leiden: Brill, 2005); R. D. Aus, *Two Puzzling Baptisms: First Corinthians 10:1–5 and 15:29: Studies in their Judaic Background* (Lanham: Hamilton, 2017).

16 Luke's sermon receives a short coverage in A. Ganes, *The Web of Empire: English Cosmopolitans in an Age of Expansion, 1560–1660* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), 225. She does not appear to note the importance of the accent on history and "plain reading."

17 J. Luke, *Sermon Preached before the Right Worshipfull Company of the Levant Merchants at St Olav's Hart-Street, Thursday Dec 15, 1664*. (London: R. Daniell, 1698), 14.

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

this informative history was not confined to Christian sources. The ritual in the Christian text, he argued, might be able to be elucidated by practices that were evident in Greek and Roman culture, such as lustrations for the dead practiced at the calends of February by the Romans.[18] The "history-of-religions" school might wait until the end of the nineteenth century for formal conceptualization,[19] but the roots are clearly evident here two centuries before.

Of particular importance is a rhetorical aside that Luke makes when he refers to an ancient notice of the church of Smyrna. It is worth quoting:

> concerning the martyrdom of the famous S. Polycarp, … the Christians used to assemble at his tomb for performing festival celebrations in honour to his memory, and for exercising, preparing and confirming others to the same conflict for the holy Faith; a custom well known to many here present to be in some part continued by the poor reliques of that once famous and flourishing Church to this very day.[20]

Here is an acknowledgement that the presence of English people focused on commercial ventures in Türkiye was also prizing open other, less-obviously mercantile opportunities. The appeal to "many here present" was a critical confirmatory witness to archaeological remains and observance of then-current Greek customs ("the poor reliques"!).[21] The rhetorical flourish nevertheless indicates that the gaining of this knowledge was already becoming a well-known practice amongst the European nationals gathered at Smyrna (and Constantinople). There was genuine excitement in re-establishing physical contact with a site mentioned in "the holy scriptures".

Attachment to Asian topography was retained, in microcosm, by the expropriation of *in situ* material artifacts that testified to the site. Both the making of a tour and the continued reflection on (retrieved) artifacts were seen as pious acts. A contemporary, George Wheler, credited the chaplain John Luke for improving the "Devotions" of Smyrna "factors" (that is, businessmen). This was demonstrated in the increased numbers of merchants (and occasionally the consul) joining Luke on his expeditions to the cities of the Book of Revelation's seven churches.[22] Pack animals returned with carry-pouches laden with items collected along the journey.[23] Wheler again mused without any trou-

18 Luke, *Sermon*, 24.

19 See Nasrallah, *Archaeology and the Letters of Paul*, 22.

20 Luke, *Sermon*, 15.

21 The visit to Polycarp's tomb is mentioned by travellers before John Luke in their, then-unpublished journals. See, for example, R. C. Anderson (ed.), *The Journals of Sir Thomas Allin* (London: Navy Records Society, 2 vols, 1939–40), vol 1, 14 (an entry dated 19th December 1660).

22 Wheler, *A Journey to Greece*, 230.

23 This appropriation accelerated in the nineteenth century as the Ottoman empire was encouraged to modernize. Western powers were eager to assist in the laying of railway lines across the country — which, inter alia, facilitated the removal of artifacts. See M. Greenhalgh, *From the Romans to the Railways: The Fate of Antiquities in Asia Minor* (Leiden: Brill, 2013).

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027

bling of the order of things, that "no place has contributed more than Smyrna to enrich the collections and cabinets of the curious in Europe."[24] The buzz of interest in what were called "medals" (a fateful designation of the bronze coins essential to the Roman economy),[25] developed into a justifying construction of numismatic meditation as an act of piety. Early in the nineteenth century, William Till repeated Renaissance ideas,[26] arguing that the sheer gazing on coins would bequeath moral advancement (usually along the lines of adherence to an injunction to pay government taxes!).[27] Whatever the rationale for ethical curation, collecting such treasures was certainly a means of guaranteeing a retirement nest-egg or a testamentary legacy for the end of a person's life, when the artifacts were sold off,[28] or, occasionally, bequeathed to a museum.

Even with the moral overlays, the contact with sites began a remarkable process of reconfiguring the attitude toward the past and the material referent of texts, both scriptural and classical. History was in the process of being turned from a providential periodisation of time directed toward an eschatological *telos* into a material testimonial to the truth of ancient texts. There was no diminution at this stage in the instruction about the providential meaning and intent of history, no question that history would do anything other than prove the truth of the literary text. Indeed such history could prove particularly advantageous in repudiating certain methods and results of exegesis. Two targets especially came into view: the allegorization of the churches of the Apocalypse as a gradated ascent in spirituality; and the construction of prophetic ages of the Church built on the same magnificent seven. But materiality had entered the arena of text to yield a construction of history and biblical inter-

24 Wheler, *Journey*, 72.

25 On the critical importance of bronze currency, see C. Katsari, *The Roman Monetary System: The Eastern Provinces from the First to the Third Century AD* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), 136–154. The old notion that these bronzes were commemorative "medallions" or occasional largesse needs to be dismissed, unless compelling evidence suggests otherwise. For this obsolete interpretation see B. V. M. Head, *A Catalogue of the Greek Coins in the British Museum* (London: British Museum, 1906), li; C. Babington, "On Two unedited Autonomous Coins of Colossae in Phrygia," *NC* (ns) 3 (1863): 2.

26 See J. Cunnally, *Images of the Illustrious: The Numismatic Presence in the Renaissance* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1999).

27 W. Till, *An Essay on the Roman Denarius and English Silver Penny …* (London: Longman, Brown, Green and Longmans, 1838), 31–32. See A. H. Cadwallader, "In Go(l)d we Trust: Literary and Economic Exchange in the Debate over Caesar's Coin (Mk 12:13–17)," *BibInterp* 14.5 (2006): 486–91.

28 See, for example, the substantial array of Richard Pococke's collection: *A Catalogue of a Large and Curious Collection of Ancient Statues, Urns, Mummies, Fossils, Shells and Other Curiosities, of the Right Reverend Dr. Pococke, Lord Bishop of Meath, Deceased; Collected by his Lordship, during his Travels. Which (by order of the Administrator) will be sold by Auction, Bt Mr. Langford and Son, At their House in the Great Piazza, Covent Garden, on Thursday the 5th, and Friday the 6th of this instant June 1766*. It took three days to clear the bidding on items. Other famous explorers or residents in Asia Minor are regularly named in auctions of their coins and artifacts — such as William Hamilton, Henry Borrell, James Whittal among many others.

ISBN Print: 9783525500026 — ISBN E-Book: 9783647500027